Northern District of California

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN JOSE DIVISION

CISCO SYSTEMS INC, Plaintiff, v. ARISTA NETWORKS, INC.,

Defendant.

Case No. 14-cv-05344-BLF

OMNIBUS ORDER REGARDING DAUBERT SEALING MOTIONS

[Re: ECF 419, 422, 426, 438, 462, 467, 470, 475, 476, 491, 494, 498]

Before the Court are the parties' administrative motions to file under seal portions of their briefing and exhibits in connection with the parties' *Daubert* motions. ECF 419, 422, 426, 438, 462, 467, 470, 475, 476, 491, 494, 498. For the reasons stated below, the motions are GRANTED IN PART AND DENIED IN PART.

I. **LEGAL STANDARD**

"Historically, courts have recognized a 'general right to inspect and copy public records and documents, including judicial records and documents." Kamakana v. City and Cnty. of Honolulu, 447 F.3d 1172, 1178 (9th Cir. 2006) (quoting Nixon v. Warner Commc'ns, Inc., 435) U.S. 589, 597 & n.7 (1978)). Consequently, access to motions and their attachments that are "more than tangentially related to the merits of a case" may be sealed only upon a showing of "compelling reasons" for sealing. Ctr. for Auto Safety v. Chrysler Grp., LLC, 809 F.3d 1092, 1101–02 (9th Cir. 2016). Filings that are only tangentially related to the merits may be sealed upon a lesser showing of "good cause." *Id.* at 1097. In addition, sealing motions filed in this district must be "narrowly tailored to seek sealing only of sealable material." Civil L.R. 79-5(b). A party moving to seal a document in whole or in part must file a declaration establishing that the identified material is "sealable." Civ. L.R. 79-5(d)(1)(A). "Reference to a stipulation or

protective order that allows a party to designate certain documents as confidential is not sufficient to establish that a document, or portions thereof, are sealable." Id.

DISCUSSION II.

The Court has reviewed the parties' sealing motions and respective declarations in support thereof. The Court finds the parties have articulated compelling reasons to seal certain portions of most of the submitted documents. The proposed redactions are also narrowly tailored. The Court's rulings on the sealing request are set forth in the tables below:

A. ECF 419		
Identification of Documents to be Sealed	Description of Documents	Court's Order
Arista's Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Kevin C. Almeroth	Cisco does not seek to seal the highlighted portions.	DENIED.
Exhibit 1 to the Declaration of Ryan Wong in Support of Arista's Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Kevin C. Almeroth ("Wong Daubert Declaration") (Excerpts from the "Opening Expert Report of Kevin Almeroth Regarding Copy" dated June 3, 2016)	Paragraphs ¶¶ 83-86, 118, 119 and pages 437-661 ("Copying Exhibit 6") contain information about Cisco's source code. Paragraphs ¶¶ 73, 74, 78, 79, 112, 118, 138-142, 145, 147, 148, 152, 153, 157, 195, 203, 219 (and associated images on pages 107 through 115), 220, 239-242, 246, 250-52, 257 and footnotes 99, 102 contain information of Arista's software and business strategies.	GRANTED as to Paragraphs ¶¶ 83-86, 118, 119 and pages 437-661; and ¶¶ 73, 74, 78, 79, 112, 118, 138-142, 145, 147, 148, 152, 153, 157, 195, 203, 219 (and associated images on pages 107 through 115), 220, 239-242, 246, 250-52, 257 and footnotes 99, 102; and DENIED as to remainder.
Exhibit 2 to the Wong <i>Daubert</i> Declaration (Excerpts from the "Rebuttal Expert Report of Kevin Almeroth" dated June 17, 2016)	Paragraphs ¶¶ 104, 134, 137, 138, 142, 143, 144-47, 149, 154 and footnotes 106, 112 contain information of Arista's software, products, and business strategies, as well as discussion of a confidential ITC order.	GRANTED as to Paragraphs ¶¶ 104, 134, 137, 138, 142, 143, 144-47, 149, 154 and footnotes 106, 112; and DENIED as to remainder.
Exhibit 3 to the Wong <i>Daubert</i> Declaration (Excerpts from the deposition of Dr. Kevin	Testimony of Dr. Almeroth at 145:22-24 contains information regarding Arista's	GRANTED as to 145:22-24, and 289:21-291:14; and DENIED as to remainder.

Almeroth)	customer information.	
	Testimony at 200.21 201.14	
	Testimony at 289:21-291:14,	
	contains information about	
	Cisco's confidential	
	technology.	
Exhibit 4 to the Wong <i>Daubert</i>	Contains information	GRANTED.
Declaration (Cisco's	regarding Cisco's technology	
Supplemental Objections and	and source code.	
Responses to Defendant's		
Interrogatory No. 20)		
I		

B. ECF 422

B. ECF 422		
Identification of Documents	Description of Documents	Court's Order
to be Sealed		
Arista's Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Judith A. Chevalier	Page 2, lines 10-13; page 6, lines 10-26; page 7, lines 4-6 contain information of Arista's marketing and sales	GRANTED as to 2:10-13, 6:10-26, and 7:4-6; and DENIED as to remainder.
Exhibit A to the Declaration of Elizabeth k. McCloskey in Support of Arista's Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Judith A. Chevalier	Information about Arista's and Cisco's sales, customers, competitive strategies.	GRANTED.
Exhibit B to the Declaration of Elizabeth K. McCloskey in Support of Arista's Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Judith A. Chevalier	Portions of the document from 154:1-157:17, 157:18-166:19, 194:21-196:10 and 218:8-18 contain information about Cisco's sales strategies, competitive strategies and customers.	GRANTED as to 154:1- 157:17, 157:18-166:19, 194:21-196:10 and 218:8-18; and DENIED as to remainder.
Exhibit C to the Declaration of Elizabeth K. McCloskey in Support of Arista's Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Judith A. Chevalier	Contains parties' detailed confidential business information.	GRANTED.
Exhibit D to the Declaration of Elizabeth K. McCloskey in Support of Arista's Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Judith A. Chevalier	Highlighted portions contain parties' detailed confidential business information.	GRANTED.
Exhibit E to the Declaration of Elizabeth K. McCloskey in Support of Arista's Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and	Contains detailed parties' confidential business information.	GRANTED.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

28

Testimony of Dr. Judith A.		
Chevalier		
Exhibit F to the Declaration	Contains confidential	GRANTED.
of Elizabeth K. McCloskey in	business, product, and	
Support of Arista's Motion to	customer information.	
Strike Expert Opinions and		
Testimony of Dr. Judith A.		
Chevalier		

C. ECF 426

C. ECF 420	D	C 41 O 1
Identification of Documents	Description of Documents	Court's Order
to be Sealed		
Cisco's Motion to Exclude	Arista does not seek to seal	DENIED.
Expert Opinion Testimony	the highlighted portions.	
From Arista's Expert Dr.		
John Black		
Cisco's Motion to Exclude	Arista does not seek to seal	DENIED.
Expert Opinion Testimony	the highlighted portions.	
From Arista's Expert William		
M. Seifert		
Cisco's Motion to Exclude	Pages 4, 5, 6:3, and 7:7	GRANTED as to pages 4, 5,
Expert Opinion Testimony	contains Arista's confidential	6:3, and 7:7; and DENIED as
From Arista's Expert Cate M.	business and sales	to remainder.
Elsten	information.	
Exhibit 1 to the Declaration	Paragraphs ¶¶ 120, 123-125,	GRANTED as to Paragraphs
of Andrew M. Holmes "Black	132, 161, 433, 438, 448-459,	¶¶ 120, 123-125, 132, 161,
Opening Report"	461-471, 478-482, 498, 500-	375-377, 397, 433, 438, 448-
	502, 504, 508, 510, 514, 515,	459, 461-471, 478-482, 498,
	570, 580, 636, 689-691, 696,	500-502, 504, 508, 510, 514,
	700 and footnotes 32, 35, 40,	515, 519, 525, 570, 580, 636,
	and 128 contain information	678(i), 689-691, 696, 700 and
	related to Cisco's source	footnotes 32, 35, 40, and 128;
	code, third-party source code,	and redacted portions on page
	as well as Cisco's business	141, 142, and 143 of Exhibit
	information.	A to non-party Dell's
		declaration, ECF 442; and
	Paragraph 397 contains	DENIED as to remainder.
	confidential information	
	related to Arista EOS	
	software. Paragraphs ¶¶ 519,	
	525, and 678(i) contain	
	information related to	
	Arista's source code.	
	Paragraphs ¶¶ 375-377	
	contain confidential	
	information related to	
	Juniper's software.	
	bamper b bottmute.	

	ı	1
Exhibit 2 to the Holmes Declaration "Black Rebuttal Report"	Portions redacted on page 141, 142, and 143 of Exhibit A to non-party Dell's declaration, ECF 442, contain Dell's confidential customer information. Paragraphs ¶¶ 50-51, 55, 148, 155, 156, 159, 160, 165, and 170 contain information related to Cisco's source code, third-party source code, and confidential business information.	GRANTED as to Paragraphs ¶¶ 50-51, 55, 148, 155, 156, 159, 160-166 and 169-171; and DENIED as to remainder.
	Paragraphs ¶¶ 148, 155, 156, 160-166, and 169-171 contain confidential information related to Arista's source code.	
Exhibit 4 to the Holmes Declaration	Arista does not seek to seal this exhibit, which contains excerpts of Dr. Black's deposition transcript.	DENIED.
Exhibit 5 to the Holmes Declaration "Seifert Report"	Paragraphs ¶¶ 90 (including footnote 78), 96 (including charts on Pages 43 and 44), 97 (including footnote 88), 98 (including footnotes 89–91), 99 (including footnote 92), 100(i), 100(ii) (including footnote 94), 100(iv) (including footnote 95), 100(v) (including footnote 97), 101, 103 (including footnote 106), 108, and 109 contain Arista's confidential sales and customer information. Portions of paragraph 79 contain confidential	GRANTED as to Paragraphs ¶¶ 90 (including footnote 78), 96 (including charts on Pages 43 and 44), 97 (including footnote 88), 98 (including footnotes 89–91), 99 (including footnote 92), 100(i), 100(ii) (including footnote 94), 100(iv) (including footnote 95), 100(v) (including footnote 97), 101, 103 (including footnote 106), 108, and 109; and portions of ¶ 79 relating to Juniper's software and trade secrets; and DENIED as to remainder.
	information of Juniper's software and trade secrets.	
Exhibit 6 to the Holmes Declaration	Pages 135-36 (13:42:25– 13:43:52) contain Arista's confidential business information.	GRANTED as to pages 135-36 (13:42:25–13:43:52); and DENIED as to remainder.

Exhibit 7 to the Holmes	Pages 7, 9, 14, 15, 21-28, 32,	GRANTED as to pages 7, 9,
Declaration "Elsten June 3,	and 33 contain Cisco's	14, 15, 17, 21-28, 32 and 33;
2016 Report"	confidential business	and DENIED as to
	information.	remainder.
	Pages 9, 17, 22-23 contain	
	Arista's confidential business,	
	product and customer	
	information.	
Exhibit 8 to the Holmes	Contains parties' confidential	GRANTED.
Declaration "Elsten Rebuttal	business and customer	
Report"	information.	CD ANTENDA TO A CT AT
Exhibit 9 to the Holmes	58:2-65:25 contain	GRANTED as to 58:2-65:25;
Declaration	information related to Cisco's	and pages 58-60, 62–65, 81,
	customers and Cisco's	and 212-215; and DENIED
	confidential business	as to remainder.
	information.	
	Pages 58-60, 62–65, 81, and	
	212-215 contain Arista's	
	confidential customer and	
	business information.	
Exhibit 10 to the Holmes	Contains Cisco's business	GRANTED.
Declaration	information and competitive	GRANTED.
Beckuration	intelligence and related	
	strategies.	
Exhibit 12 to the Holmes	Paragraphs ¶¶ 170-191	GRANTED as to ¶¶ 170-191;
Declaration "Clark June 3,	contain information related to	and DENIED as to
2016 Report"	Juniper's software and trade	remainder.
	secrets.	
Exhibit 13 to the Holmes	Arista does not seek to seal	DENIED.
Declaration (Excerpts of the	these excerpts of Dr. Clark's	
"Clark Rebuttal Report")	Rebuttal Report.	

D. ECF 438

Identification of Documents	Description of Documents	Court's Order
to be Sealed		
Arista's <i>Corrected</i> Motion to	Cisco does not seek to seal the	DENIED.
Strike Expert Opinions and	highlighted portions.	
Testimony of Dr. Kevin C.		
Almeroth		

E. ECF 462

Identification of Documents	Description of Documents	Court's Order
to be Sealed		
Arista's Opposition to Cisco's	Highlighted text on page 8 at	GRANTED as to the
Motion to Exclude Expert	lines 25-26 contains Cisco's	highlighted text at 8:25-26;
Opinion Testimony of Dr. John	confidential litigation	and DENIED as to remainder.

Black	settlement.	
Exhibit 4 to the Declaration of Ryan Wong in Support of Arista's Opposition to Exclude Expert Opinion Testimony of John Black ("Wong Opp. Declaration") (Excerpts from the deposition transcript of Dr. Kevin C. Almeroth, taken on June 28, 2016)	Cisco does not seek to seal these excerpts of Dr. Almeroth's deposition transcript.	DENIED.
Exhibit 5 to the Wong Opp. Declaration (Excerpts from the "Rebuttal Expert Report of Kevin Almeroth" dated June 17, 2016)	Cisco does not seek to seal these excerpts of Dr. Almeroth's Rebuttal Report.	DENIED.

F. ECF 467

Identification of Documents	Description of Documents	Court's Order
to be Sealed		
Arista's Opposition to Cisco's	Highlighted portions contain	GRANTED.
Motion to Exclude Expert	Arista's confidential business	
Testimony from Arista's	and product information.	
Expert Cate M. Elsten		
	Highlighted text on page 8 at	
	lines 1-4 contains Cisco's	
	confidential business	
	information.	
Exhibit A to the Declaration of	Cisco does not seek to seal this	DENIED.
Eduardo E. Santacana in	exhibit, which contains	
Support of Arista's Opposition	excerpts of Dr. Chevalier's	
to Cisco's Motion to Exclude	deposition transcript.	
Expert Testimony from		
Arista's Expert Cate M. Elsten		

G. ECF 470

Identification of Documents	Description of Documents	Court's Order
to be Sealed		
Arista Network Inc.'s Opposition to Cisco's Motion to Exclude Expert Opinion Testimony of William M. Seifert Exhibit 1 to the Declaration of Andrea Nill Sanchez in Support of Arista Network Inc.'s Opposition to Cisco Systems, Inc.'s Motion to Exclude Opinion Testimony of William M. Seifert ("Exhibit 1")	Cisco did not file a declaration in support of sealing the highlighted portions of this exhibit that cite to Mr. Seifert's deposition transcript. Cisco did not file a declaration in support of sealing this exhibit, which contains excerpts of Mr. Seifert's deposition transcript.	DENIED. DENIED.
Exhibit 4 to the Declaration of	Excerpts from the Expert	GRANTED.

3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

26

27

28

1

2

- 11			
	Andrea Nill Sanchez in Support of Arista Network Inc.'s Opposition to Cisco Systems, Inc.'s Motion to Exclude Opinion Testimony of William M. Seifert ("Exhibit 4")	Report of Judith A. Chevalier (submitted on June 24, 2016) contain Arista's confidential business information, such as marketing and sales strategies.	
	Exhibit 5 to the Declaration of Andrea Nill Sanchez in Support of Arista Network Inc.'s Opposition to Cisco Systems, Inc.'s Motion to Exclude Opinion Testimony of William M. Seifert ("Exhibit 5")	Excerpts from the Rebuttal Expert Report on Fair Use of Judith A. Chevalier (submitted on June 17, 2016) contain Arista's confidential customer and product information.	GRANTED.

H. ECF 475

Identification of Documents		
to be Sealed	Description of Documents	Court's Oruci
Cisco's Opposition to Arista's Corrected Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Kevin C. Almeroth. Exhibit 1 to the Declaration of John M.	Highlighted text on page 4 at lines 7-13 and 16-20, page 7 at lines 26-28, page 8 at line 1, page 9 at lines 24-26, page 10 at lines 18-20 contains Arista's confidential product and customer information. Paragraphs ¶¶ 72-74 (including the image shown on Page 29)	GRANTED as to highlighted text at 4:7-13, 4:16-20; 7:26-28; 8:1; 9:24-26; 10:18-20; and DENIED as to remainder. Granted as to paragraphs ¶¶ 72-74, including the image on
Neukom in Support of Cisco's Opposition to Arista's Corrected Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Kevin C. Almeroth. ("Neukom Declaration")	contains Arista's confidential product and business information.	page 29; and DENIED as to remainder.
Exhibit 2 to the Neukom Declaration	Arista does not seek to file under seal this exhibit, which contains excerpts of Dr. Almeroth's deposition transcript.	DENIED.
Exhibit 3 to the Neukom Declaration	Arista does not seek to file under seal this exhibit, which contains excerpts of Dr. Black's deposition transcript.	DENIED.

I. ECF 476

Identification of Documents	Description of Documents	Court's Order
to be Sealed		
Cisco's Opposition to	Highlighted text on page 1 at	GRANTED as to 1:24-26; 8:9-

Arista's Motion to Exclude	lines 24-26, page 8 at lines 9-	13 & n.3; 9:6-26; 10:3-24; and
Expert Opinion Testimony	13 and footnote 3, page 9 at	DENIED as to remainder.
From Dr. Judith A.	lines 6-26, page 10 at lines 3-	
Chevalier	24 contains Arista's	
	confidential product, customer,	
	and business information.	
Exhibit 1 to the	Excerpts from Anshul	GRANTED.
Declaration of Sara E.	Sadana's deposition transcript	
Jenkins in Support of	contain Arista's confidential	
Cisco's Opposition to	customer and product	
Arista's Motion to Exclude	information.	
Expert Opinion Testimony		
From Dr. Judith A.		
Chevalier		
	•	

J. ECF 491

Identification of Documents	Description of Documents	Court's Order
to be Sealed		
Defendant Arista Networks, Inc.'s Reply in Support of its Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Judith A. Chevalier	Highlighted portions contain Arista's confidential software and business information. Cisco did not file a declaration in support of sealing the highlighted text at 1:13-14.	GRANTED as to highlighted portions at 1:20, 24; 4:3-4; 5:9-11; and DENIED as to 1:13-14.

K. ECF 494

Identification of Documents	Description of Documents	Court's Order
to be Sealed		
Defendant Arista Networks, Inc.'s Reply in Support of its Motion to Strike Expert Opinions and Testimony of Dr. Kevin C. Almeroth	Highlighted portions on page 5 at lines 7-11 and line 17 contain Arista's confidential software, sales, and product information.	GRANTED as to the highlighted portions at 5:7-11 and 17; and DENIED as to remainder.
	Cisco did not file a declaration in support of sealing the remaining highlighted portions.	

L. ECF 498

L. ECF 490		
Identification of Documents	Description of Documents	Court's Order
to be Sealed		
Cisco's Reply in Support	Arista did not file a declaration	DENIED.
of Its Motion to Exclude	in support of sealing this	
Expert Opinion Testimony	exhibit.	
From Arista's Expert Dr.		
Cisco's Reply in Support of Its Motion to Exclude Expert Opinion Testimony From Arista's Expert Dr. John Black		
Cisco's Reply in Support	Arista did not file a declaration	DENIED.
	•	

of Its Motion to Exclude	in support of sealing this	
Expert Opinion Testimony	exhibit.	
From Arista's Expert		
William M. Seifert		
Cisco's Reply in Support	Highlighted portions contain	GRANTED.
of Its Motion to Exclude	Arista's confidential product,	
Expert Opinion Testimony	sales, and customer	
From Arista's Expert Cate	information.	
M. Elsten		

III. ORDER

For the foregoing reasons, the sealing motions at ECF 419, 422, 426, 438, 462, 467, 470, 475, 476, 491, 494, 498 are GRANTED IN PART and DENIED IN PART. Under Civil Local Rule 79-5(e)(2), for any request that has been denied because the party designating a document as confidential or subject to a protective order has not provided sufficient reasons to seal, the submitting party must file the unredacted (or lesser redacted) documents into the public record no earlier than 4 days and no later than 10 days form the filing of this order.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: September 16, 2016

BETH LABSON FREEMAN United States District Judge